Census of forced evictions in living areas occupied by Roma (or people designated as such) in France

(Third quarter of 2017)

Summary

A significant increase in evictions has been noted during the summer period, affecting 4,538 Romani people, which is two times higher compared to the previous quarter of 2017 when a total of 2,011 total evictees were registered.

Between July and September, 4,538 Romani people were evicted from 34 living areas in France (slums and squats); 3,436 of them were forcefully evicted by the authorities during 25 operations; 28 Romani individuals were evicted from one living place due to a fire; and 1074 people left their living areas under pressure of imminent forced eviction.

This represents an increase in the number of people leaving their living areas before the operation carried out by the authorities aiming to evict them. Thus, 1074 Roma people left eight settlements before the arrival of the police, which is more than twice the total in the previous quarter (454 people). It should be noted that six of these living areas were affected by a legal decision ordering a forced eviction of the inhabitants and two settlements were served a notice that conditions in the settlements were hazardous to health by local authorities ordering an eviction within 48 hours.

During the third quarter of 2017 the number of evictions based on notices for health hazards or dangerous living conditions issued by local authorities or prefectures decreased. Nine evictions have been carried out following such notices. However such evictions are based only on an administrative decision without the intervention of a judge who is able to assess their legality, utility, methods and deadlines.

On only 18 occasions out of a total of 34 evictions were the evictees offered shelter. Families and individuals were put out on the street following another 16 operations, eight of which were carried out by the authorities without any alternative solutions for shelter or accommodation being offered to the evictees. The re-housing measures taken by the authorities do not respect the provisions of the circular of 26th August 2012\(^1\), which established the legal obligation of the authorities to assess those families and individuals before the eviction and propose solutions for their accommodation according to their needs. The rehousing measures taken by the

\(^1\)http://www.vie-publique.fr/actualite/alaune/campements-illicites-cadre-action-pour-services-etat.html
authorities are limited to an offer of short-term shelter proposed to only some of the evictees, deemed to be vulnerable. Such measures seem to be inefficient as they do not provide any sustainable solutions for access to housing and accommodation aiming to resolve the issue of substandard housing faced by Romani families all over the country. Subsequently, many of them go back to slums or squats to face the likelihood of further forced evictions, increasing poverty and deprivation. Moreover the lack of sustainable solutions for housing and accommodation, as well as repeated forced evictions lead to forced migration within a department or a region having a negative impact on the access to rights and the whole integration process of the Romani families living in slums and squats.

Some positive results have been observed in Toulouse where local and state authorities dismantled the Ginestous2 slum on 10 July, based on a legal decision and respecting the provision of the circular of 26 August 2012. During this joint operation between local, state authorities and civil society, temporary shelter or alternative accommodation was offered to 165 of the total 350 evictees. Moreover, the municipality took measures for social inclusion of 119 people, including 40 minors in the field of housing, education and employment by signing a tenancy agreement with the families for their re-housing.3 Another 117 people, members of the Travellers community, were offered shelter in a halting area but they refused it estimating this measure does not correspond to their accommodation needs. Toulouse’s example shows that a socially responsible approach to the dismantling of slums, and the provision of sustainable solutions to those evicted is possible when there is a political willingness and cooperation between local and state authorities to integrate Romani families into French society. However such measures remain isolated cases, as the majority of the evictions are carried out without any sustainable solution for housing that would allow families to combat substandard housing, poverty and social exclusion.

The results for the third quarter show that 24 of the evictions concern slums/squats built on land owned by public bodies compared to only eight where the land owned by private persons. This contrasts with the recent census4 of illegal camps, slums and squats published by the Inter-ministerial delegation for access to housing and accommodation (DIHAL), which showed almost an equal divide between lands owned by public bodies (51%) and those one owned by private persons (48%). The high rate of such evictions suggests the lack of political willingness of public authorities for integrating the Romani families living in slums and squats in France for years5 as the DIHAL’s census shows. Additionally, only five building projects were reported concerning the evacuated areas Building projects are often used to justify the need for a forced eviction.

---

3 DIHAL Newsletter July/August 2017.
5 Since 2012 the number of people living in camps/slums/squats varies between 15 000 and 20 000 (Source DIHAL).
The results show that, similar to previous quarters, the Ile-de-France region remains the focus of the majority of the operations as well as the majority of the evictees, accounting for 76% of the evicted people between July and September 2017. Moreover the nineteen operations registered in Paris region affect more than 50% of the total 6,000 Roma living in slums and squats in Paris region while the DIHAL’s census\(^6\) from April 2017 showed that 38% of the total people living in slums and squats are based in Paris region. Also, evictions were carried out in Hauts-de-France (8%), PACA region (7%) and Occitanie (5%) Auvergne-Rhône-Alpes (4%)

**Note:**

This census is the result of joint work between the League of Human Rights (LDH) and the European Roma Rights Centre (ERRC) with the cooperation of Romeurope. Due to the lack of available official data, this report does not claim to be exhaustive, but does constitute the most detailed and objective account of the current situation of evictions of Romani people in France.

---

\(^6\) DIHAL, Etat des lieux national des campements illicites, grands squats et bidonvilles, April 2017 (9th edition).
2. **Comparison to Previous Periods & Analysis of third quarter of 2017**

The following tables detail the identified number of evictees, evictions, evacuations and their trends since the first quarter of 2014.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quarter</th>
<th>Total evictions executed by the authorities</th>
<th>Fire/flood/personal initiative taken under pressure</th>
<th>total evacuated area</th>
<th>Shelter offered to some of the evictees</th>
<th>People evicted by the authorities</th>
<th>People evicted due to a fire/flood/personal initiative taken under pressure</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1Q2014</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>2904</td>
<td>524</td>
<td>3429</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2Q2014</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>3756</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>3807</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3Q2014</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>3683</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>3757</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4Q2014</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>3130</td>
<td>317</td>
<td>3447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>138</strong></td>
<td><strong>17</strong></td>
<td><strong>195</strong></td>
<td><strong>71</strong></td>
<td><strong>1328</strong></td>
<td><strong>110</strong></td>
<td><strong>1448</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1Q2015</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1966</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>2076</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2Q2015</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2776</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>2076</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3Q2015</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>4972</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>5072</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4Q2015</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1414</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>1614</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>111</strong></td>
<td><strong>5</strong></td>
<td><strong>116</strong></td>
<td><strong>29</strong></td>
<td><strong>1128</strong></td>
<td><strong>410</strong></td>
<td><strong>11538</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1Q2016</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3883</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>3783</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2Q2016</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>962</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>1012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3Q2016</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2516</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>2546</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4Q2016</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2958</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>2123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>76</strong></td>
<td><strong>7</strong></td>
<td><strong>83</strong></td>
<td><strong>40</strong></td>
<td><strong>10119</strong></td>
<td><strong>345</strong></td>
<td><strong>10464</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1Q2017</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1182</td>
<td>1182</td>
<td>2371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2Q2017</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>1507</td>
<td>504</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3Q2017</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>3436</td>
<td>1182</td>
<td>4618</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:** These estimates **do not include** removals from a territory following an administrative decision or repatriation by charter ordered by the Office Français de l’immigration et de l’intégration (OFII).

In general, the summer period normally marks the highest rate of forced evictions. This year is no exception.
as 4,538 persons have been evicted between July and September marking the highest number of evictees since the beginning of the year. These results demonstrate intensive forced evictions affecting 1,512 persons per month.

Forced evictions executed by the authorities remain high, with 3,436 evictees, which marked an increase compared to the same period of the previous year (2,516 for third quarter of 2016). These evictees were forcefully evicted during 25 out of the total 34 operations in France.

Also the third quarter is characterised by a significant increase of the people leaving their living areas before the arrival of the authorities aiming to carry out a forced eviction. This number (1074 people) is 2.3 times higher than the previous quarter of 2017 (454 persons). It should be noted that all the living areas were affected by a legal decision or a notice for health hazards issued by local authorities ordering the forced evictions of the inhabitants. The number of evictions due to a fire diminishes during the summer period, as only one was reported.

In total, temporary solutions for housing have been proposed on 18 occasions out of the total 34 operations registered the last quarter. Shelter has been proposed in the majority of the cases of evictions executed by the authorities (18 out of 25) although it was for a short period of time. It should be noted that the solutions for re-housing are limited to temporary shelter and concern only a limited number of the evictees. Sustainable solutions for housing aiming to challenge substandard housing and poverty among Romani families remain isolated cases (Toulouse, Triel-sur-Seine where sustainable solutions have been found for more than 60 persons before the eviction). Seven of the evictions executed by the authorities were carried out without any shelter being proposed to the evictees, even for a short period. The evictees who left their living areas before the day of the eviction (1074 persons) could not benefit from any shelter or alternative accommodation. People evicted due to a blaze affecting 28 individuals, were not offered shelter.

In other words, several hundred people were put on the street without any alternative solutions for accommodation.

Twenty-two out of a total of 34 evictions were executed in response to summonses by the landowners for illegal occupation or the establishment of squats on their properties. Romani families (or families considered to be Roma) have been evicted from nine places based on an administrative decision issued by a mayor or a prefect due to health hazards or insalubrity ordering a forced eviction. Four out of the total 34 evacuated areas were affected by both an administrative decision issued by local authorities and court decision ordering the

---

7 https://actu.fr/societe/le-demantelement-des-camps-de-roms-repousse_12721227.html
eviction. Eight living areas were vacated a few days before the destruction of the settlement due to pressure of an imminent forced eviction.

Only five construction projects were reported during the third quarter in regards to the evacuated living area cited as justification for an urgent eviction.

3. Geographical representation of the evictees by region

During the third quarter, the highest number of forced evictions was observed in Ile-de-France region, with 19 of the total 34 areas subjected to evictions. In total 3,355 people were evicted in this region, which represents more than the half of the population living in slums and squats in Paris region according to the recent DIHAL census. This accounted for 76% of the total evictees countrywide. The rest of the evictions were registered in almost equal rates in Hauts-de-France (8%) and PACA region (7%), followed by and Occitanie (5%) Auvergne-Rhône-Alpes (4%).

Geographical representation of the evictions according to the number of evictees per region
Geographical representation of the evictions according to the number of the operations per region

Representation of the evictions according to the number of the evicted people per month

The highest number of evicted people was registered in September, with 71 evictees per day, totalling 2,140 evictees for the month.
4. Incidents of Hate Crime & Hate Speech (harassment, rejections, endangerments, threats) and Counter-Statements made by International Bodies

The list below is not exhaustive and provides only a few examples of the acts of violence, hate speech and various forms of discrimination which occurred since the beginning of 2017.

During the first quarter:

- “Please, let us stay here until March-April, we have nowhere to go” said the inhabitants of the slum located at boulevard Ney in the 18th district in Paris. Without other solutions for accommodation the Roma families sent an open letter on 27th January 2017 calling on the French authorities for an extension of the deadline for dismantling the slum.9

- On 27th of January, Marine Le Pen, a candidate in the French presidential elections and a member of the European Parliament, during a formal visit as part of her election campaign in Denain blamed the local Roma community for the alleged insecurity in the city. In a press conference which took place the same day, Le Pen claimed there was a “security problem”10 in Denain “because there are 1,000 Roma all over the city”.11

- “We really live from day to day, we do not know if we will succeed in eating properly the next day ....” One inhabitant of the slum located near Porte de la Chapelle in Paris alerted the public for the appalling conditions of more than 500 Roma people who lived in extreme poverty, in makeshift housing, without access to drinking water and any sanitary facilities.12

- In its annual report, Abbé-Pierre Foundation highlights the need for a redefinition of the “framework of the national mission to reduce slums”, which has come to an end in 2016. “No matter where they come from, their administrative situation and their location, people forced to live in slums must not continue to be subjected to a security policy of repeated evictions and expulsions without any solution rather than to be subjected to a social policy in regards with people in precarious situations, according

---

to the circular of 2012”.  

- On 7th February, the Court of Cessation upheld the conviction of Luc Jousse, the former mayor of Roquebrune-sur-Argens for his statements against the Roma in 2013. The former mayor was sentenced to € 10,000 fine and one year of ineligibility.  

- “Young Romanian girls” are subjected to different treatment by the court compared to other girls accused of similar acts. “While girls generally avoid prison, this is not the case for Romani adolescents. In some prisons they constitute as much as three-quarters of all incarcerated minors” as shown in the results of the study on the impact of gender stereotypes in the juvenile court conducted by the sociologist Arthur Vuattoux.  

- Education is one of the main factors for successful integration of the Romani population and combating poverty. However, for Roma in France, education remains “an elusive path to integration” because of “systematic discrimination” that Roma face, causing numerous obstacles for the integration of this population.  

- Marie-Carole Ciuntu, mayor of Sucy-en-Brie, who was prosecuted for discrimination following the refusal to enroll Romani children in school who have lived in a slum, was found not guilty when the Court of Appeal overruled this decision, much to the disappointment of the parents who claimed their children are being denied access to education.  

- On 7th February a fire broke out in a slum located in Rungis destroying 8-10 shacks. This fire caused considerable losses for several families living in a precarious situation in makeshift shelters. On 16th February the Collectif National des droits de l’homme (National network for Human rights, CNDH in French) published its annual report. The report calls on French presidential candidates to emphasize the need of combatting slums as forms of substandard housing. “After twenty-five years of badly coordinated and destructive public policies for those who concerned, the CNDH calls on the state as well as the public authorities to join forces to create an ambitious and rights-respecting policy for the

---

17 Europe 1, Une maire accusée d’avoir refusé de scolariser des Roma mise hors de cause, 10 February 2017: http://www.europe1.fr/societe/une-maire-accusee-davoir-refuse-de-scolariser-des-roms-mise-hors-de-cause-2974883  
dismantling of slums”.

- Four Romani children have been denied access to education by the municipality of Prémesques. Pascale Alliot, (LR party), a deputy mayor in charge of school enrolment justified the refusal for school enrolment with pending proceedings against the family living without authorisation in an abandoned building: “We are waiting for the results of the proceedings to see if it is worth it or not to enrol the children in school”.

- The Court of Appeal of Aix-en-Provence has confirmed the sentence of Jean-Marie Le Pen, President of honour for the National Front party, who was previously sued for his statement against Roma in 2013, claiming the presence of Roma was “urticating” and “odorous”.

- “No French family is evicted from his house because its child commits a theft”- claimed Dominique Plancke, an activist member of the Collectif de solidarité Roms (a grassroot NGO) in Lille conglomeration, regarding the eviction of Romani families living in Saint-André. This eviction was carried out after a jogger was attacked near the Romani settlement where Romani teenagers were suspected of being the perpetrators. “I do not endorse the attack, but [I think] the sentence is discriminatory”, said the activist.

- Franck Sinisi, a local official from the far-right Front national in the Fontaine municipality stood before the disciplinary commission of his party for a statement that he had made on 27th February. During a formal session of the City Council, he had suggested to “remove the gold teeth of Roma” so they could provide “self-funding” of their accommodation in Fontaine. He proposed “the conglomeration should pay the dentist [to remove their gold teeth]”, which was deemed as “unacceptable” but was claimed to be a “bad joke” by Nicolas Bay, the General Secretary of the National Front.

- Radost Zaharieva argued that ‘evacuations’ provide the pretext for forced evictions of Roma in France, in an article published on the ERRC Blog, 3rd of March.
On the night of 4th to 5th March, a seventy-year-old man was severely injured after a fire broke out in a slum in Roubaix.28

“Children living in slums and squats - mainly from Romania and Bulgaria and of Roma ethnicity - are often victims of 'counter refusals' when they submit requests for school enrolment in the city hall. These ‘counter refusals’ are only the visible part of the iceberg: numerous administrative pretexts, delays and abusive requests [for documents] prevent families from having their requests for school enrolment completed. Moreover, once they [Romani children] are enrolled in school, the precarious situation of their families (the poor living conditions, but also repeated forced evictions from slums) does not allow them to follow a continuing education or to study under correct conditions; The societal rejection which they undergo finally pushes the majority of them towards school dropout”.29

On the night of the 7th March a car parked “only a few meters from the Romani settlement [...]” located at Chazy street in Hellemmes was burned with a Molotov cocktail. A few weeks before this incident “a caravan was burned just after a quarrel occurred between Romani families and some young non-Roma young coming ‘to play’” in the Romani settlement. The inhabitants were forcefully evicted on the morning of 8th March.30

More than one hundred Roma people were put on the streets due to fire which broke out in their squat in Villeurbanne, reported Lyon Capitale on 14th March.31

Jean-Luc Munro, a local official from EELV (the so-called ‘green party’) in Loos and an activist supporting Romani families in that municipality, denounced an “attempt at intimidation” for a “solidarity crime” following the court decision of 15th March, condemning the local official for “hurting a police officer with his bike” when he went to the Romani settlement the day the families were evicted. 32

On 16th March the Administrative court cancelled the decision of the mayor of Ris-Orangis to enrol Romani children in a separated class where only Romani children can attend school and ordered him...
to enrol them in a regular school.33 However the court failed to investigate ethnic discrimination.34

- On 18th March the Collectif de solidarité Roms in Lille Conglomeration sent a letter of concern to the editor-in-chief of the daily newspaper La Voix du Nord. The NGO expressed its outrage following a press article published by the newspaper called “La friche H2D est toujours un gruyère d’où les Roms entrent et sortent” (The wasteland H2D is still a Gruyère [cheese] from which the Roma enter and go out)”.35 According to the NGO it is “[...] a violation of the human dignity of the concerned people”. Also the organisation emphasizes the use of the term of "Roma" which is “global and stigmatising” as “some Roma” individual may be involved in the incident reported by the newspaper, not “the Roma”.

- Report released by European Roma rights centre reveals “chocking disparities” in access to water and sanitation between Roma and the rest of the population.36 The research conducted in 18 Romani living areas in France has shown that Romani people living in slums and squats often do not have access to drinking water and sanitation.

- In its annual report published on 30th March, the National Consultative Commission for Human Right highlighted the presence of “intensified racism” leading to violations of fundamental rights. Antigypsyism is expressed both by “rejection of the cultural differences” as well as the perception of Roma as a “threat to the national [security] order [...]” powered by political discourse tending to justify the failure of integration initiatives “by the mere attitude of the beneficiaries”. Another example of the rejection of the Roma community is the “ambiguous policy towards slum dismantling, in which the repressive approach being favoured [...]” leading to “organized wandering”.37

- On 30th March a member of the Gitan38 community died during his arrest in Seur where he lived with his family. He was “killed”39 during an operation by the police and elite forces called GIGN when he was shot death with seven bullets. Police sources say the investigation does not exclude “the possibility

35 La Voix du Nord, 13th of March.
38 This person was designated as Gitan by certain media in France but he is a member of the Travellers community. In France the term “Travellers (Gens de voyage) refers to an administrative category related to itinerant trade activities et does not concern an ethnicity. However the Council of Europe uses the term “Roma and Travellers” to encompass on the one hand a) Roma, Sinti/Mansush, Calé, Kaale, Romaniachals, Boyash/Rudari; b) Balkan Egyptians (Egyptians and Ashkali); c) Eastern groups (Dom, Lom and Abdal); and, on the other hand, groups such as Travellers, Yenish, and the populations designated under the administrative term “Gens du voyage”, as well as persons who identify themselves as Gypsies.
of an eventual training” explaining the joint operation of National Police and elite forces leading to the death of the young man.40

**During the second quarter:**

- **On 5th April** a French comedy was launched that has sparked many debates because of its stereotypical representation of Roma through the movie.41 The comedy called “Warmly Welcome” represents Roma community based on existing stereotypes common in France.42 “This movie, full of racist clichés and stigmatizing prejudices, is [like] a mirror showing the different treatment to which Roma are subjected in France”43 - says Romeurope in a press release. The comedy has been qualified as racist and dangerous44 promoting a racist caricature of Roma community and stigmatizing this population in France.45

- **On 8th April,** members of the Roma community as well as an Iraqi family accommodated in a church in Roubaix were subjected to a gun attack by “young people from the neighbourhood”.46 First, they launched stones into the church’s doors and injured one person. Later, two BMW cars came in front of the church where the families were targeted by a gun fire. The authorities opened an investigation.

- **NGO’s in Marseille** call on the authorities to take measures allowing the local Roma families to benefit from the stabilisation needed for their integration into the French society. “We can try to propose them solutions for insertion through education and employment instead of evicting them from these unoccupied areas”, suggests Caroline Godard from Rencontres tsiganes NGO.47

- “Repeated forced evictions from living areas put the evictees in a vicious circle of poverty, undermine other processes [for social inclusion] (medical care, education, training, employment) and force evictees to only maintain short term objectives and suffer communal feelings of insecurity” says the Belgium newspaper La Libre about slums and squats in Marseille where Roma migrants live, in most

41 [http://www.huffingtonpost.fr/valerie-rodrigue/a-bras-ouverts-ne-ma-pas-fait-rire-il-ma-ecoeuree_a_22025048/](http://www.huffingtonpost.fr/valerie-rodrigue/a-bras-ouverts-ne-ma-pas-fait-rire-il-ma-ecoeuree_a_22025048/)
44 [http://www.lemonde.fr/cinema/article/2017/04/05/a-bras-ouverts-racisme-a-doses-allopathiques_5106367_3476.html](http://www.lemonde.fr/cinema/article/2017/04/05/a-bras-ouverts-racisme-a-doses-allopathiques_5106367_3476.html)
of the cases, without access to basic facilities such as drinking water or toilets.48

● On 13th of April Roma families living in slums and squats in Montpellier organised a protest in the city hall of the municipality calling on local authorities to adopt a policy based on the human rights respect making possible social inclusion of the Romani families in Montpellier.49

● On 27th April local officials from the Socialist party organised a protest blocking the national road N315 near the Roma slum in Gennevilliers calling on the state authorities to dismantle the slum. This protest was facilitated by an order taken previously by the mayor aiming to close the national road N315. Moreover, the protesters used vehicles to block the road provided by the municipality as reported France Soir50.

● A protest has been organised in Blois following the murder of Angélo Garand, member of the Travellers51 community who died during his arrest in Seur. Protesters and the victim’s family call for “justice and true” for “everyone”.52 Aurélie Garand, the sister of the victim states that “often Travellers, face violence […]” in regards with the death of his brother after who died by “[…] seven bullets, without expecting it, without any possibilities to escape…”53

● On 5th May, a fire broke out in a Roma slum located in Wasquehal. The mayor proposed a forced eviction of the “illegal camp” as response to the accident likely caused by the poor living conditions in the settlement.54

● On 5th May, the European Roma Rights Centre released a video calling on Emmanuel Macron, candidate for the Presidential elections reaching the second round, for changing the approach toward Roma people living in slums and squats, focusing on forced evictions and anti-Gypsyism. “Short term coercive responses make no-long term sense; discrimination and exclusion is costly and counter-productive. And it brings shame to the Republic”, says the organisation.55

● One Roma family living in an abandoned farm in Prémesques (Nord) has been evicted the day before

50 This incident does not concern people living in slums/squats but was recorded because the victim was designated as Gitan by certain media.
51 La Nouvelle République, Blois: 250 personnes dans la rue réclament justice pour Angelo, 22nd April: http://www.lanouvellerepublique.fr/Loir-et-Cher/Actualite/Faits-divers-justice/n/Contenus/Articles/2017/04/22/Blois-250 personnes-dans-la-rue-reclament-justice-pour-Angelo-3076003
52 La Nouvelle République, Mort d'Angelo : pourquoi une telle violence ?, 31st May: http://www.lanouvellerepublique.fr/Indre-et-Loire/Actualite/Faits-divers-justice/n/Contenus/Articles/2017/05/31/Mort-d-Angelo-pourquoi-une-telle-violence-3117934
54 http://www.errc.org/article/macron-election-call-out/4573
the proceedings in appeal in regards with an eventual eviction. The French authorities evicted the family before the court issue a judgement, denying them their right to an effective remedy before a national authority (art.13, ECHR).56

● A Roma slum located in the 18th district of Paris underwent unlawful evictions. The inhabitants were evicted from on 22th February 2017, facing an eviction for the second time, the first took place one year previously. Without any sustainable solutions for housing, they have come back to the slum at boulevard Ney. 57

● On 17th May 2017, a new study has been released by Trajectoires58 regarding slums in France and access to common law for those who live in such places. This study includes a survey which shows that 98% of people living in slums come from Romania and 90% of them identify themselves as Roma.59 According to this research, 30% of the children living in slums and squats have never been enrolled in school, “which can be explained with the process of ghettoization and/or commuting involving the family. This situation of early school leaving or total absence of school enrolment seem to be totally neglected by public authorities”. 60

● On 18th May, an open letter has been published by the organisation Terre d’errance calling on the French president for a “moratorium” on forced evictions affecting people living in slums and squats, to avoid increasing poverty among the affected individuals as well as to “give sufficient deadlines to local officials, public authorities, inhabitants and organisation [...] to find adapted and human rights respectful solutions”. 61

● In response to a letter sent in May by Romeurope, the French party “En Marche!”, whose candidate Emmanuel Macron, won the French presidential elections stated: “Destroying [slums] without any alternative solutions is a hypocritical, expensive and inefficient method. Public authorities together with inhabitants, neighbours and NGOs have to find solutions before destroying [slums] or evicting [people], as it leads to the creation of a new camp”.62

● On the night of 20th to 21st May, Romani migrants, refugees and asylum seekers originating from Kosovo, Albania and Montenegro, living in a camp near the Alpes stadium at Avenue Valmy in

---

60 Trajectoires, Habitats des bidonvilles en France, connaissance des parcours et accès au droit commun, May 2017, p.5.
Grenoble, were subjected to an attack by several motorcyclists armed with baseball bats and sticks\textsuperscript{63}, who threatened the Romani families and ordered them to leave the place.

- On 22\textsuperscript{nd} May, Roma migrants, refugees and asylum seekers from Kosovo, Albania and Montenegro were subjected to an arson attack in a camp called Valmy in Grenoble\textsuperscript{64}. Unknown individuals threw a Molotov cocktail, causing a fire in the camp, burning a car\textsuperscript{65}. In a video published by France 3, witnesses suspect members of the far-right movement who held a meeting on 20 May near Grenoble.\textsuperscript{66}

- On 13\textsuperscript{th} June, the Court of Appeal in Montpellier condemned the local official M.Domergue to a 1000-euro fine for his statement against Roma that he has made in 2014 during his election campaign. The court qualified it as hate speech targeting “a specific group: the Roma”. The Ligue des droits de l’homme recalls the need of respecting Human rights which are “universal”. “Tolerating violation of the rights of a Roma or other individuals harms Human rights at all”.\textsuperscript{67}

- “In Gallieni and elsewhere in the town the Bulgarian Roma or others occupy the sidewalks armed with their false crutches; they go to Paris to beg without paying their tickets [for public transportation] and strip [steal] from [all] French people and Foreigners that they can reach”.\textsuperscript{68} This racist statement targeting Roma communities has been published in the municipal newsletter of Bagnolet City on 24\textsuperscript{th} June in an article signed by Mr. Jacques Nio, a local official from the party Les Républicains\textsuperscript{69}.

- On 26\textsuperscript{th} June, Romeurope released a paper addressing illegal forced evictions of Roma in France. “We hope to contribute [...]to the Human rights defence of those who continue to be subjected to decision ordering evictions which are not in accordance with the International law standards”.\textsuperscript{70}

**During the third quarter:**

- On 4\textsuperscript{th} July, the Penal court sentenced a 71-years-old retiree to two years imprisonment for sexually abusing from Romani children living in extremely poor areas. Since 2009, he was forming confidence-

\textsuperscript{63} Alpes 1, Grenoble, 22nd May: [http://grandgrenoble.alpes1.com/news/locales/18146/grenoble-le-camp-de-valmy-attaqu-de-nuit](http://grandgrenoble.alpes1.com/news/locales/18146/grenoble-le-camp-de-valmy-attaqu-de-nuit)

\textsuperscript{64} Place Gre’Net, 23rd May: [http://www.placegrenet.fr/2017/05/23/agression-de-migrants-incendie-riverains-excedes-tension-monte-autour-camp-valmy/139137](http://www.placegrenet.fr/2017/05/23/agression-de-migrants-incendie-riverains-excedes-tension-monte-autour-camp-valmy/139137)


\textsuperscript{70} Romeurope, press release, 26th June: [http://www.romeurope.org/note-droits-habitants-de-terrain-procedure-dexpulsion/](http://www.romeurope.org/note-droits-habitants-de-terrain-procedure-dexpulsion/)
inspiring relationships with vulnerable Roma families and then sexually abusing their children. 71

- On 4th July, local officials from Gennevilliers organised a protest causing serious traffic disruptions in the highway Paris-countryside to call for dismantling of the slum located in this municipality. This action aimed to support the mayor’s request to evict Romani families living in a slum near the highway in Gennevilliers, despite the fact that on 4th May the court of Nanterre had granted the families a four-month deadline before the eviction. 73

- On 31st July a fire broke out in a Roma slum located near the national road N315 in Gennevilliers burning more than 100m² of shacks and personal belongings of several families. According to Médecins du Monde estimations about 300 people lived there in extreme poverty without access to clean water and sanitation. The inhabitants were evicted on 26 September.

- On 2nd August, the Council of Europe honoured victims of Roma Holocaust stressing, “the importance of not only recalling past injustices, but also of improving Roma rights today and in the future”. 76

- On 4th August the NGOs Collectif de solidarité Rom and AREAS La Sauvegarde du Nord sent a proposal to the mayor of Villeneuve d’Ascq including an area where Romani families could benefit from alternative housing and support for social inclusion instead of facing repeated forced evictions without any sustainable solutions for housing. The deputy mayor says “the city and the inhabitants of the municipality have suffered for years from illegal settlements of Roma [...] and Travellers” in response to the NGOs’ request. 79

- A swastika was painted on the stele of the memorial of the former concentration camp in Sallier, near Arles (Bouches-du-Rhône) where seven hundred Roma, Gitans and Gypsies were detained in terrible conditions between 1942 and 1944. In 2006 a stele was inaugurated as a reminder of the racist
treatment of 6000 Nomads in France. The network Mémorial des Nomades de France filed a complaint against the local authorities for the lack of a public response condemning the racist act.

- Mediapart denounced a racist act targeting Roma. A picture has been taken in Paris at Passerelle des Arts bridge showing a black spiral and the inscription: “Attention: les Romans” (Be careful! [there are] Roma.

- “Thousands of children cannot go to school this year” says the Collectif pour le droit des enfants roms à l'éducation (CDERE) in a press release published on 1st September. Recent research conducted by CDERE showed that Romani children are denied access to schooling by a combination of repeated forced evictions, the refusal of mayors to permit school enrolment, and a lack of housing. The organisation calls on the Ministry of Education to take measures to stop this “unworthy, shameful and contrary to human rights situation”.

- In an open letter published on 7th September the NGOs AREA, La Cimade, Médecins du Monde, Amnesty International groupe Montpellier, Collectif Migrant-e-s Bienvenue 34, Habiter Enfin !, Ligue des droits de l’homme and Mouvement contre le racism et pour l’amitié entre les peoples, called on the mayor of Montpellier to participate in the creation of “an ambitious social policy”, with “clear objectives regarding slums dismantling”, including consultation with civil society, institutions and public authorities. This open letter was in response to the mayor’s letter sent to the Minister of Interior asking him to reinforce the police in order to ensure the security in the city. The mayor’s request is due to Roma slums located in Montpellier and the mayor’s concerns about their impact on “the demographic trend and the competitiveness of the city” as well as “the need to overcome the social risks” targeting Roma population.

- On 28th August, the grassroots NGO Collectif de solidarité Roms Lille-Métropole published a press released denouncing a “forced eviction that does not respect the rights of the inhabitants” living in the slum Pont-Royal in Lille. According to the NGO, the inhabitants were not notified about a court decision ordering the eviction. Moreover, an administrative notice issued by the mayor/prefect has

---

83 [https://blogs.mediapart.fr/juliette-keating/blog/190817/elle-est-ou-lhorreur](https://blogs.mediapart.fr/juliette-keating/blog/190817/elle-est-ou-lhorreur)
84 [http://www.romeurope.org/de-rentree-musique-milliers-denfants-precaires-communique-de-presse-cdere/](http://www.romeurope.org/de-rentree-musique-milliers-denfants-precaires-communique-de-presse-cdere/)
85 Ados en bidonville et en squats: l’école impossible?
not been presented to the families “chased from their homes”.\(^88\)

- The French Ombudsman issued a decision about mayor’s refusal to enrol in school Roma children living in camps. In his decision \(^n\ 2017-095\) the Ombudsman concluded that this constituted “a violation of right to education as well as the greatest interests of the child”. The Ombudsman’s finding was that the refusal to allow school enrolment amounted to “discrimination in access to education based on the living place and the particular vulnerability resulting from social status of the families”. Also the French Ombudsman recalled the mayor’ legal obligation to enrol in school all the children living in his municipality.\(^89\)

- Franck Sinisi, a local official in Fontaine municipality from the Front national has been excluded from the far-right party based on a decision of its disciplinary commission following his statement against Roma, made in February 2017 during a session of the City council\(^90\). In fact he suggested “the municipality to pay the dentist to remove the golden teeth of Roma\(^91\)” to provide self-funding for their accommodation, currently paid by local authorities. Sinisi’s statement was a deliberate reference to the treatment to which Roma were subjected in concentration camps.

- A fire\(^92\) broke out in a Roma slum in Villeneuve-Saint-Georges on 11\(^{th}\) September burning 12 shacks. It was probably caused by the bad living conditions in the slum. The inhabitants were evicted on 28\(^{th}\) September.\(^93\)

- On 16\(^{th}\) September a fire broke out in a Roma slum in 14\(^{th}\) district in Marseille burning 75\% of the settlement, including shacks and personal belongings of the inhabitants as well as ID cards. About 110 people, including children live there in very poor living conditions without access to clean water and sanitation.\(^94\)

- In a press release published on 26\(^{th}\) September the French grassroots NGO Romeurope 94 denounces “an absurd policy of evictions creating the feeling of hate and racism […]” about forced evictions carried out in department 94 where around 450 people were subjected to a forced eviction during the summer period and calls on the authorities to “stop this policy which put vulnerable people at the street

---


\(^89\) Défenseur des droits, press release, 5th September: https://www.defenseurdesdroits.fr/fr/defense-des-droits-de-l-enfant/2017/09/maxime

\(^90\) https://www.placegrenet.fr/2017/09/12/fontaine-conseiller-municipal-franck-sinisi-exclu-front-national/151787

\(^91\) City Council, session of 27th February 2017: http://cm.ville-fontaine.fr/2017/cm-20170227.mp3

\(^92\) Romeurope 94, press release, 12th September.


Double standards have been established in Lille conglomeration by the public transportation company TRANSPOLE and local authorities of Lille regarding travel discounts for adolescents enrolled in middle school. The discount depends on the family quotient system related to the Caisse d’allocations familiales (Family allocations office), and in practice this excludes Romani adolescents living in slums and squats as their parents can’t benefit from family allowances. Thus Roma teenagers living in extremely poor areas, and enrolled in middle school, have to pay the highest monthly fee to get to school on public transport.

5. Detailed results for the first quarter of 2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Municipality(ies)</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Number of people visited by the authorities</th>
<th>Number of people evicted because of flooding</th>
<th>Nasha (1 = partial)</th>
<th>Order of the Mayor Project (4th fragment)</th>
<th>Local initiative taken under pressure</th>
<th>Public decision on the project</th>
<th>Source/Reactions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3-65 Haute-Brulée</td>
<td>St-Denis</td>
<td>Ile-de-France</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Avril 8, 10 January 2017</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-65 Trouville</td>
<td>Saint-Denis</td>
<td>Saint-Denis</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Avril 8, 10 January 2017</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-65 Mont-Grifflard</td>
<td>Villiers-le-Bel</td>
<td>Val-d'Oise</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Paris, 2 June 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-65 Lillois</td>
<td>Noyelles-sur-Sambre</td>
<td>Saint-Saint-Denis</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Avril 8, 10 January 2017</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11-65 Raon-l’Étape</td>
<td>Paris 15th</td>
<td>Paris</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10 Mosque, 7 February</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-65 Gare de l’Est</td>
<td>Paris 10th</td>
<td>Paris</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15-65 Les Invalides</td>
<td>Paris 6th</td>
<td>Paris</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17-65 Le Perreux-sur-Marne</td>
<td>Marne-la-Vallée</td>
<td>Seine-et-Marne</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19-65 Courbevoie</td>
<td>Courbevoie</td>
<td>Hauts-de-Seine</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21-65 Puteaux</td>
<td>Nanterre</td>
<td>Hauts-de-Seine</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23-65 Auteuil</td>
<td>Paris 16th</td>
<td>Paris</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-65 Meudon</td>
<td>Meudon</td>
<td>Hauts-de-Seine</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27-65 Versailles</td>
<td>Versailles</td>
<td>Yvelines</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29-65 Châtenay-Malabry</td>
<td>Châtenay-Malabry</td>
<td>Hauts-de-Seine</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-65 Le Plessis-Trévise</td>
<td>Le Plessis-Trévise</td>
<td>Yvelines</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33-65 Île-de-France</td>
<td>Île-de-France</td>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>237</td>
<td>237</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8+7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


### 6. Detailed results for the second quarter of 2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Quarters</th>
<th>Total results</th>
<th>Number of people considered by the authorities</th>
<th>Number of people considered by the population</th>
<th>Number of people considered by the legal person</th>
<th>Legal decision of the legal person</th>
<th>Derivation of the legal person</th>
<th>Derivation of the population</th>
<th>Derivation of the authorities</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 7. Detailed results for the third quarter of 2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Quarters</th>
<th>Total results</th>
<th>Number of people considered by the authorities</th>
<th>Number of people considered by the population</th>
<th>Number of people considered by the legal person</th>
<th>Legal decision of the legal person</th>
<th>Derivation of the legal person</th>
<th>Derivation of the population</th>
<th>Derivation of the authorities</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

21
Annex

Description of the data used in the study

The study identified the name of the living site, the municipality, the number of evictees, the causes of the forced evacuation, rehousing proposals, the legal basis for the eviction (leaving proceedings initiated by the owner of the site, or notice issued by the mayor or the prefect) and the sources of information in each case.

Each forced evacuation is described in the most comprehensive manner and only verifiable information obtained from reliable sources, listed below, is recorded.

Definitions and Vocabulary:

In France, land is evacuated and the person is evicted. In terms of the law, land is evacuated as well as buildings when these measures are taken in an area; an eviction is a process in which these measures relate to a person. On the other hand, the term "living area" defines the place where people live, which could be a slum, a squat, a disused hangar or a functional or non-functional caravan. The name of the living area is mentioned in the source of information, for instance "le Hanul". The exact address is also noted when this information is available.

The municipality refers to where the living area is situated. Cases are frequent when the area overlaps several municipalities, for example: Noisy-le-Grand/Bry-sur-Marne. These cases often lead to confusion: many different reports appear describing the same living area. Particular attention has been paid to this fact in order to guarantee that the information is accurate and not duplicated.

The dates mentioned in the study refer to the day on which the forced eviction took place.

The number of evicted persons is always mentioned in the source of information.

The forced eviction might result from expulsion for illegal occupation or health hazards or an accident (fire). In many cases several events have a cumulative effect. For example, in Massy (Essonne) in 2010, there was the distribution of a OQTF (Obligation to leave the French territory document), a fire, an eviction order, confinement, voluntary returns (ARV in French), forced returns as well as the destruction of what remained of the living area by the municipal authorities.

When solutions for housing are mentioned in the source of information, it is also mentioned in the figures.
They are usually partial, because in most of the cases, they separate families, and concern only mothers with young children whom are given emergency accommodation for a few days. For this reason, they are often refused by those people they are offered to.

The nature of the decision certifying the evacuations is recorded. It can be taken by the Court (Magistrate’ Court, Regional Court, Administrative Court, Court of appeal), or can be provoked by a notice for health hazards or other dangers ordered by a municipality or a Prefect.

The number of unforced departures is recorded as well. In general these are often provoked by police harassment or threats.

The owner of the land may be a private person or public body. The category "public" includes municipalities, departments, local or national authorities, as well as any other body under the State authority (for example Réseau Ferré de France). The category "private" includes private legal entities or physical persons.

The "source" is the origin of the information. The same case can be present in many sources. Each source is recorded. Only the most reliable and the most accurate were selected: press and media articles, press releases, and direct testimonies transmitted and broadcast by an NGO.